



UTILIZATION OF PEDAGOGICAL APPROACHES BY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHERS IN A DIVISION TOWARDS AN ENHANCED MENTORING PLAN

MYLIN GAMBOA – SAN JOSE

<https://orcid.org/0009-0007-0367-8975>

mylin.sanjose@deped.gov.ph

Asinan Elementary School

Olongapo City, Zambales Philippines

Abstract: *The global educational system has dynamically incorporated various approaches to help teachers fulfill their functions. Hence, this study concentrated on investigating the pedagogical approaches used by elementary teachers in the Division of Olongapo City during the School Year 2022-2023 toward an enhanced mentoring plan. A descriptive correlational study using weighted mean, ANOVA, and person r was employed. Most respondents have been in public school for 4-6 years, with master units, Teacher I, and attended 1-3 seminars related to the pedagogical approach. Moreover, the respondents' utilization of pedagogical approaches was "Very Great Extent." In addition, the majority of the respondents had outstanding performance ratings. Further, findings revealed no significant difference in the respondents' utilization of pedagogical approaches when grouped according to their number of years in public school, and highest educational attainment. There is a significant difference when grouped according to teaching position and the number of training sessions related to pedagogical approaches. Lastly, the extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches had a significantly low positive correlation with their performance rating. Based on the outcomes of this study, a mentoring plan was proposed, wherein teachers are encouraged to have career progression and professional development through full utilization of pedagogical approaches.*

Keywords: *Elementary teachers, pedagogical approaches, performance, descriptive-correlational, Olongapo City, Philippines*

INTRODUCTION

The worldwide educational system has rapidly adopted many methods to help teachers educate and build skills. The knowledge provider must now disclose how they track different types of students in the subject. Learning activities can be acquired by developing physical, emotional, intellectual, and social skills. Multiple academic institutions are adopting problem-based learning methodologies that require students to be creative, problem-solvers, critical thinkers, and analysts. This study considers tactics and approaches important given these learner expectations. These strategies could boost an academic institution's graduates. Innovation and originality engage and excite students, resulting in high-quality learning. Research on how teachers plan and teach utilizing curriculum materials is growing. This study shows that competent instructors evaluate and change curriculum materials to make them helpful (Drake & Sherin, 2019). First, school districts regularly approve and require published curricula (Ball & Cohen, 2016). Although the quality of these programs varies, they provide teachers with much-needed materials. For instance, many fail to consider opposing viewpoints, offer pertinent representations and phenomena, and support sense-making. Raymond (2021) provides insights into a transactional view of curriculum systems, suggesting that a reciprocal relationship exists between teachers and the curriculum materials they use. Teachers who lack the skills to examine curriculum materials effectively may be unable to identify the advantages and disadvantages, leading to inappropriate pedagogical approaches. In this study, the researcher tackled the extent of teachers' utilization of pedagogical approaches. Given the ongoing emphasis on inquiry teaching, evaluating the efficacy of different teaching approaches remains a significant topic. Inquiry-based instruction is promoted in the teaching of sciences, according to Bernido (2020). However, studies that concentrate on research environments as opposed to conventional classroom settings have provided the majority of the supporting empirical evidence (Jiang, 2015). A complex activity that includes making



observations, formulating questions, looking up information in books and other sources, planning investigations, reviewing prior knowledge in light of experimental evidence, using tools to collect data, analyze it, and interpret it, coming up with explanations and predictions, and reporting the findings (Cairns, 2017). Students' freedom to design the inquiry explains the diversity in approaches. Moreover, the nuanced understanding of autonomy articulated by Agustina (2017) highlights that autonomy can encompass various dimensions, ranging from inherent capacities to learned skills in taking responsibility for one's own learning. Educators have developed integrated curricula and instructional methods in response to cognitive science findings that learning is contextual, socially constructed, and culturally affected. Moreover, Berestova et al. (2022) assess factors influencing academic motivation in e-learning contexts and emphasize the importance of flexibility and student control as critical motivators. Research by Long & Davis (2017) emphasizes the role of arts integration in promoting collaboration and creativity within educational settings. Research supports the notion that arts integration provides meaningful contexts for students to apply critical thinking skills in problem-solving scenarios Sanz-Camarero et al. (2023). The best art for math instruction is music. Scales, harmony, tuning, temperaments, melody, rhythm, intervals, and scales are related in mathematics and music. The systematic literature review conducted by Supriyadi et al. (2022) presents additional empirical evidence supporting the relationship between music and mathematics. Mina et al. (2021) support this notion by demonstrating the role of music therapy in improving outcomes for children with learning disabilities, including difficulties in mathematics.

In the Philippines, Santos and Castro (2021) conducted a study on pedagogical approaches, and they mentioned that education is dynamic, so it needs innovative and responsive pedagogical approaches. Teachers must be proficient in instructional competencies to instruct students and maximize their knowledge and skills acquisition effectively (West et al., 2017). Today's students think and learn fundamentally differently than their predecessors did. Modifying how teaching is delivered may be the most intense adaptation strategy needed for some pupils (Iris Center, 2019). The 21st century's use of technology to assist teachers in delivering lessons and students in learning completes the PCK paradigm, which stands for Pedagogy, Content Knowledge (TPACK). The technological pedagogical content knowledge (TPACK) framework and educational research highly value context. However, TPACK research frequently fails to define it clearly (Rosenberg & Koehler, 2015). The students value the usage of technology in the classroom. (Rucsanda et al., 2021) found that online learning methods, while effective for theoretical components, might not be as beneficial for practical group activities in music education. The study indicated that the online context could hinder collaborative musical experiences, emphasizing the need for a more balanced instructional approach that utilizes both traditional and digital methodologies (Rucsanda et al., 2021). In the instructional process, a reflective approach is crucial for ensuring that student activities are founded on beginning concepts, the construction of subjects' interests in the studied topics, and their growth through time. By establishing a reflective learning environment, teachers may help students get a deeper awareness of themselves and ensure they are motivated to learn by developing an interest in the material's importance and substance. Support for their innovative ideas throughout the analytical process, encouragement of their activities, and unbiased conclusions for the growth of their worldview based on the analysis findings are all encouraged. Developing a reflective educational environment based on integrating a reflective approach into the pedagogical process is sufficient to help students develop a rich understanding of the past and future, encourage them to engage in analytical activity, foster reflection, and increase their sense of independence, which has been lacking in the Division of Olongapo as evidenced by observations of master teachers, school heads and supervisors.



While studies have shown the limitations and difficulties in implementing pedagogical approaches in teaching and learning in primary schools, their value has been growing. Implementing the curriculum in schools is primarily the responsibility of primary school teachers. The research listed above paints a picture of how elementary school teachers perform on instructional tasks that many teachers should look into their pedagogical approaches. Hence, how teachers are taught to achieve such a purpose must be linked to the solutions for practical pedagogical approaches. Particular attention must be paid to the possibility that primary teachers were forced to enter the profession before receiving the required training in educational methods while considering answers and remedies to the problematic situation. To manage a classroom, teachers must be equipped with elements of basic teaching processes, abilities, and pedagogical approaches. With such an impulse, this study investigated the extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches of elementary teachers in a division in terms of inquiry-based, integrative, collaborative, constructivist, and reflective to develop a mentoring program.

FRAMEWORK

The primary foundation of this research is Pedagogic Theory. As per the National College for Teaching and Leadership (2022), Pedagogic Theory encompasses the following: it gives careful thought to student's voice; it relies on behavior (what teachers do), knowledge and understanding (what teachers know), and beliefs (why teachers act as they do); it involves thinking clearly about both short- and long-term learning outcomes; it builds on students' prior learning and experience; it involves scaffolding students' learning; it involves a variety of techniques, such as whole-class and structured group work, guided learning, and individual activity; it emphasizes the development of higher order thinking and metacognition, making effective use of dialogue and questioning to achieve this; it embeds assessment for learning; and it is inclusive and takes into account the diverse needs of a range of learners. Rokhmah et al. (2024) state that teaching literature through an aesthetic lens fosters emotional intelligence and enhances students' engagement with the subject matter. The paradigm of the study used the Input-Process-Output model. The input comprises the elementary teacher profile, such as several years of teaching in public school, highest educational attainment, teaching position, and several training and seminars related to pedagogical approaches. Likewise, the extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches in terms of inquiry-based, integrative, collaborative, constructivist, and reflective are also included in the input. Lastly, the respondents' performance during School Year 2022-2023 is also examined. On the other box, the process section of the research paradigm comprises data collection procedure and statistical treatment: percentage, mean, ANOVA, and Pearson r Product-Moment Correlation coefficient. Lastly, the output is a mentoring plan for elementary school teachers in the Olongapo City division.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

This study was conducted to: (1) assess the extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches of the teachers; (2) describe the teaching performance of the teachers; (3) determine the significant difference in the extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches among the respondents when grouped according to profile variables; (4) investigate the significant relationship between the utilization of pedagogical approaches of the respondents and their performance rating; and (5) develop a mentoring plan to properly guide the teachers on the utilization of pedagogical approaches.

METHODOLOGY



Research Design

The researcher employed a descriptive correlational strategy for this investigation. According to Bueno (2019), descriptive correlational design requires data gathering to address inquiries about the subject's present condition. It is generally gathered through a questionnaire survey, documentary analysis of the information already accessible, and data supported by an interview or an observation at a particular moment. A method where individuals' results on two variables are assessed, with no altered variables, to see if there is a link.

Research Site

This study was conducted in the Schools Division Office of Olongapo City. It is a 1st class highly urbanized city in the Central Luzon region of the Philippines. Located in the province of Zambales but governed independently from the province, it has a population of 260,317 people according to the 2020 census.

Participants

The respondents in this study were the two hundred nine (209) elementary teachers during school year 2022-2023. For this reason the researcher employed Stratified Proportionate Random Sampling method.

Instrumentation

The data came from a questionnaire with three (3) parts. Part I contained the academic profile of the respondents. Next is Part II, which gathered information on the respondent's extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches using the following scale: (4) very great extent, (3) great extent, (2) moderate extent, and (1) low extent. Last is Part III, which elicited the respondents' performance rating during the school year 2022-2023. The questions were adopted and modified from Carag's (2020) study entitled "Pedagogical Approaches Used by Teachers in the Division of Tuguegarao City, Philippines." *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation*, Vol. 24, Issue 08, 2020. ISSN: 1475-7192. The results of a reliability test on the degree of use of different pedagogical approaches for an educational tool are shown in Table 1. The Cronbach's Alpha values for each technique and the number of entries in each category are given. The findings show that all of the instructional strategies evaluated by the tool exhibit satisfactory levels of reliability, as shown by Cronbach's Alpha values, which range from 0.71 to 0.77. In particular, all strategies—Inquiry-Based, Integrative, Collaborative, Constructivist, and Reflective—show satisfactory internal consistency, with each strategy's Cronbach's Alpha value within an acceptable range. This shows that the tool accurately gauges the application of various pedagogical strategies in learning environments, offering a solid basis for additional examination and interpretation of the gathered data.

Ethical Considerations

Following the Data Privacy Act of 2012, the researcher asked for the respondents' informed consent before asking them to finish the questionnaire. A suitable statistical approach was used to collect and evaluate the data. After completion, the paper was delivered to the research advisor. The study was changed after taking the feedback into account. The researcher ensured no plagiarism in the work, that authors were credited correctly, and that all references were properly cited. As dealing with people covers many ethical considerations, the researchers set out to gain respondents' confidence, get reliable data, and uphold the science's openness.



Data Collection

The researcher wrote a letter to the Schools Division Superintendent to ask permission to survey the respondents. Once the permit was approved, the researcher proceeded to the school principals of the respondents to present the permit and send the Google Form link to the questionnaire. The researcher ensured the survey content was explicit to the respondents by attaching a letter of instruction and answering queries through messenger. The responses were automatically tabulated in an Excel sheet using a Google Form link.

Statistical Techniques

The following statistical tools were used for better understanding, analysis, and interpretation of data. First is the percentage and mean, which were used to determine the proportion of the respondent's academic profile and the extent of utilization of pedagogical strategies. Also, Analysis of Variance or ANOVA was used to determine significant differences in the extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches among the teacher-respondents when grouped according to profile variables. Lastly, Person r product moment correlation was used to investigate the significant relationship between the utilization of pedagogical approaches of the teacher-respondents and their performance rating during the school year 2022-2023.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Profile of the Respondents

The results showed that most respondents have been in public school for 4-6 years, with master units, Teacher I, and have attended 1-3 seminars related to pedagogical approaches. The study by (Negassa & Engdasew, 2017) contributes to this discussion by examining pedagogical skills improvement programs at a university level. Their research indicates that improved pedagogical skills significantly affect teaching approaches and student learning outcomes. Meanwhile, R. A. 10533 requires compliance with Rule III: Teacher Qualifications, Training, and Continuing Professional Development. "Enhanced Basic Education Act of 2013". According to the Department of Education, teachers are encouraged to pursue graduate studies to advance their skills and capabilities and better serve their students. In line with the study's findings, most teachers do not have graduate study degrees; hence, they must be encouraged in line with professional growth, development, and career progression. Likewise, DepEd Order no. 66, s. 2007, "Revised Guidelines on the Appointment and Promotion of Other Teaching, Related Teaching, and Non-Teaching Positions," takes into account past successes, significant accomplishments, degrees, training, psychodynamic or personality qualities, and the potential of teacher applications when determining growth and professional promotion. Because of this, primary teachers should pursue excellence, further their education, find applicable training, and advance in their professions while utilizing appropriate pedagogical approaches. Lastly, According to DepEd Order No. 35, s. 2016, the Department of Education established several training and development strategies to support teachers' requirements to foster and assist teachers' ongoing professional growth. A strong indication that elementary teachers have up-to-date information on pedagogical approaches in teaching and learning in this survey is that most respondents had recently attended seminars or training relevant to pedagogical approaches.

Respondents Utilization of Pedagogical Approaches

Moreover, the respondents' use of pedagogical approaches in Inquiry-based, Integrative, Collaborative, Constructivist, and Reflective had general qualitative descriptions of "Very Great Extent." This study backs up Laksama's (2017) claim that incorporating an inquiry-based approach into the learning design entails several stages, including exploration, engagement, elaboration, explanation, and assessment. Empirically, the inquiry-based method can improve learning, mainly when learning a topic. Also, the study's findings corroborate those of Aljiffri (2015), who discovered that the integrated skill instruction methodology had a noteworthy impact on the performance of experimental group members in related language skills, such as writing and reading; experimental subjects outperformed control group members in both the comparison of all skill test scores and Social Studies performance scores. Therefore, the responders' excellent use of the integrated approach may positively affect the learning results. One of the pedagogical methods teachers embrace is the collaborative approach, where they initiate lessons by setting clear guidelines for teamwork and respectful interaction.

Summary of Utilization of Pedagogical Approaches of the Respondents

	Weighted (WX)	Mean	Qualitative Description
Inquiry-Based Approach	3.337		Very Great Extent
Integrative Approach	3.460		Very Great Extent
Collaborative Approach	3.393		Very Great Extent
Constructivist Approach	3.433		Very Great Extent
Reflective Approach	3.467		Very Great Extent

In addition, Cook et al. (2020) discovered, however, that the constructivist teaching notion was not developed and maintained, but rather what Vygotsky calls a complex—a less cohesive understanding and application of the abstraction—was produced, undercutting the relevance of using the constructivist approach. Reflective approaches involve actions and circumstances that encourage students to consider their expertise, past knowledge, and life experiences. Additionally, (Dharmasaroja, 2024) emphasizes the importance of empowering reflection and reflective writing in medical education. In this context, reflection serves as a vital tool for students to delve into their clinical experiences, fostering self-awareness, critical thinking, and empathy. This method looks closely at how the lesson was delivered and what needs to change in practice to enhance learning results. The respondents extensively utilized this kind of systematic self-observation and self-evaluation.

Performance Rating of the Respondents during the School Year 2022-2023

Most respondents had outstanding performance ratings during the school year 2022-2023. The study's findings support the K-12 Reform (R.A. 10533), which altered the country's teacher qualification standards in 2013. Similar supportive efforts must ensure that the reform process produces high-quality teachers who are suitably qualified to carry out the duties and responsibilities



of K–12 educators. One significant study by (Varghese & Musthafa, 2021) investigates teachers' perceptions regarding the integration of 21st-century skills into the curriculum.

Difference in the Extent of Utilization of Pedagogical Approaches among the Respondents when Grouped according to Profile Variables

Further, findings revealed no significant difference in the respondents' extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches when grouped according to their number of years in service in public school and highest educational attainment. The focus on continuous improvement in teaching methodologies is echoed by (Buhaenko et al., 2021), who discussed the significance of simulating pedagogical situations to help future teachers develop their individual teaching styles, which found that the profile variables of age, gender, civil status, most excellent educational attainment, and number of seminars significantly influence the teacher-respondents' use of creative tactics, supporting these findings. When the respondents' use of educational approaches was compared, a significant difference was observed when they were categorized based on their profile factors.

Relationship between Utilization of Pedagogical Approaches of the Respondents and their Performance Rating during School Year 2022-2023.

Lastly, the extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches has a significantly low positive correlation with their performance rating. The findings on a significant very low correlation between the respondents' utilization of pedagogical approaches and performance rating could mean the relationship of utilizing pedagogical approaches to teacher's performance is denoted only to some indicators of classroom observation tool, which is part of the Individual Performance Commitment and Review Form (IPCRF). Moreover, the researcher, being a master teacher responsible for classroom observation, realized that teachers exemplified different classroom approaches aside from the scope of the current study. Hence, a positive, very low correlation between these variables was found.

Pearson r Test of Correlation: Relationship between utilization of pedagogical approaches and performance rating during school year 2022-2023

RPMS-IPCRF RATING FOR SY 2022-2023					
Utilization of Inquiry-Based Approach	r	p	Decision		
	0.2	.004	Reject H_0	Significant	Low Positive
Utilization of Integrative Approach	0.189	.006	Reject H_0	Significant	Very Low Positive
Utilization of Collaborative Approach	0.2	.004	Reject H_0	Significant	Low Positive
Utilization of Constructivist Approach	0.22	.001	Reject H_0	Significant	Low Positive
Utilization of Reflective Approach	0.171	.013	Reject H_0	Significant	Very Low Positive
Extent of Utilization of Pedagogical Approaches	0.218	.002	Reject H_0	Significant	Low Positive



CONCLUSION

The results showed that most respondents have been in public school for 4-6 years, with master units, Teacher I, and have attended 1-3 seminars related to pedagogical approaches. Moreover, the respondents' use of pedagogical approaches in Inquiry-based, Integrative, Collaborative, Constructivist, and Reflective had a general qualitative description of "Very Great Extent." In addition, most respondents had outstanding performance ratings during the school year 2022-2023. Further, findings revealed no significant difference in the respondents' extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches when grouped according to their number of years in service in public school and highest educational attainment. There is a significant difference when grouped according to their teaching position and the number of training seminars related to pedagogical approaches. Lastly, the extent of utilization of pedagogical approaches had a significantly low positive correlation with their performance rating. This study lays the groundwork for evaluating elementary school teachers' use of pedagogical approaches across the division to offer suitable mentorship programs in response to obstacles and shifts in the current state of the educational system. The performance of elementary school teachers in a division and the extent to which pedagogical approaches are used are the subjects of this research; however, additional variables and factors, such as those about student performance, high school teachers, and the perception of administrators and supervisors, may have added to the body of knowledge. Meanwhile, the following recommendations are posited: First, the respondents should be encouraged to complete their Master's degree through a partnership program with colleges in the city. Next, teachers should be appropriately guided in utilizing pedagogical approaches through different means like intervention materials, projects, and research that could help them progress in their careers. It is also recommended that more seminars and training sessions about pedagogical approaches be organized and attended to be updated regardless of position, educational attainment, and years in service. Significantly, the respondents' excellent extent utilization of pedagogical approaches in all variables should be sustained. Specifically, respondents should work on improving some areas of utilizing pedagogical approaches, like giving the learners more activities that are problem-posing, immersing the learners into different disciplines to learn a given lesson, providing more opportunities for group work among students, utilizing learners own schema in resolving issues, and giving learners more control on their learning process by reflecting on their personal experience. These recommendations are expected to lift the respondents' careers and performance. Further, the Division Office may use this study's results and mentoring program to design a long-term plan for the teachers of Olongapo City. Lastly, other researchers may conduct similar studies considering the perception of school heads and supervisors, the performance of learners, and the utilization of pedagogical approaches of high school teachers.

TRANSLATIONAL RESEARCH

The results of this research can be best applied using a mentoring plan, which aims to provide opportunities to teachers for career progression and professional development by encouraging them to join graduate studies, work on their promotion and attend seminars and training; monitor milestone and career progression; conduct feedback and collaboration to share best practices; and help teachers in complete utilization of pedagogical approaches, specifically giving learners activities that are problem-posing, immersing the learners into different disciplines to learn a given lesson, providing more group work in the classroom, helping learners use their scheme in resolving issues, and guiding learners control their learning process by reflecting on their personal experiences.



LITERATURE CITED

- Aljiffri, I. H. (2015). Effects of the integrated approach to teaching English and Social Studies on achievement in a Saudi Private Elementary School. Curriculum Department, College of Education – Umm Alqura University. <https://journal.uob.edu.bh/handle/123456789/2438>
- Ball, D. & Cohen, D. (2016). Reform by the book: What is—or might be—the role of curriculum materials in teacher learning and instructional reform? Educational Researcher. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.3102/0013189X025009006>
- Bernido (2020). Assessing students' performance in guided inquiry-based learning environment, Edu. Meas. Eval. Rev. 2020 (11) (2020) 25–44. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3718379
- Buhaienko, T., Замрозович-Шадріна, С., Хренова, В., & Yudenok, V. (2021). Formation of individual style of future teachers professional activity: pedagogical situations simulation. Scientific Papers of Berdiansk State Pedagogical University Series Pedagogical Sciences, 1(3), 36-45. <https://doi.org/10.31494/2412-9208-2021-1-3-36-45>
- Cairns, D. (2017). Exploring the relations of inquiry-based teaching to science achievement and dispositions in 54 countries, Res. Sci. Educ. 49 (1) (2017) 1–23. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/323291420_Exploring_the_Relations_of_InquiryBased_Teaching_to_Science_Achievement_and_Dispositions_in_54_Countries
- Cook, L. et al., (2020). Problems in developing a constructivist approach to teaching: One teacher's transition from teacher preparation to teaching. The University of Chicago Press Journal. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/30520384_Problems_in_Developing_a_Constructivist_Approach_to_Teaching_One_Teacher's_Transition_from_Teacher_Preparation_to_Teaching
- Dharmasaroja, P. (2024). Empowering reflection and reflective writing in medical education. Ramathibodi Medical Journal, 47(2), 57-69. <https://doi.org/10.33165/rmj.2024.47.2.267231>
- Drake, C. & Sherin, M. (2019). Developing curriculum vision and trust: Changes in teachers' curriculum strategies. In J. T. Remillard, B. A. Herbel-Eisenmann, & G. M. Lloyd (Eds.), Mathematics teachers at work: Connecting curriculum materials and classroom instruction. New York: Routledge <https://www.routledge.com/MathematicsTeachers-at-Work-Connecting-Curriculum-Materials-and-ClassroomInstruction/Remillard-Herbel-EisenmannLloyd/p/book/978041589936>
- Iris Center. (2019). How can school personnel intensify and individualize instruction? <https://iris.peabody.vanderbilt.edu/module/dbi1/cresource/q2/p03/>
- Jiang, W. F. (2015). The effects of inquiry teaching on student science achievement and attitudes: Evidence from propensity score analysis of PISA data, Int. J. Sci. Educ. 37 (3) (2015) 554–576, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09500693.2014.1000426>
- Laksana, D. L. (2017). The effectiveness of inquiry-based learning for natural science learning in elementary school. Journal of Education Technology. Vol. 1 (1) pp. 1-5. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/335466493_the_effectiveness_of_inquiry_based_learning_for_natural_science_learning_in_elementary_school



- Mina, F., Darweesh, M. E. S., Khattab, A. N., & Serag, S. M. (2021). Role and efficacy of music therapy in learning disability: a systematic review. *The Egyptian Journal of Otolaryngology*, 37(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s43163-021-00091-z>
- National College for Teaching and Leadership. (2022). Pedagogic theory. The library and information association. <https://infolit.org.uk/teaching/developing-your-teaching/pedagogictheory>
- Negassa, T. and Engdasew, Z. (2017). The impacts and challenges of pedagogical skills improvement program at adama science and technology university. *International Journal of Instruction*, 10(4), 19-38. <https://doi.org/10.12973/iji.2017.1042a>
- Raymond, K. (2021). Teachers' daily practices with curriculum materials: toward a transactional view of the curriculum system. *School Science and Mathematics*, 121(8), 509-519. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ssm.12499>
- Rokhmah, D. E. L., Purwaningsih, Y. R., Anggawirya, A. M., & Floriani, R. (2024). Teaching literature: infusing literary works on language and emotional intelligence improvement. *E-Structural*, 6(02), 140-151. <https://doi.org/10.33633/es.v6i02.9308>
- Rosenberg, J. M., & Koehler, M. J. (2015). Context and technological pedagogical content knowledge (TPACK): A systematic review. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, 47(3), 186–210. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/15391523.2015.1052663>
- Rucsanda, M. D., Belibou, A., & Cazan, A. (2021). Students' attitudes toward online music education during the covid 19 lockdown. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.753785>
- Santos, T. & Castro, L. (2021). 21st century learning skills: A challenge in every classroom. *International Journal of Emerging Multidisciplinary Research*, 1(1), 31–35. <https://doi.org/10.22662/IJEMR.2017.1.1.031>
- Supriyadi, E., Dahlan, J. A., Juandi, D., Turmudi, T., Ginanjar, J., & Sugiarni, R. (2022). Ethnomathematics and music studies from scopus database: systematic literature review. *Triple S (Journals of Mathematics Education)*, 5(1), 28. <https://doi.org/10.35194/ts.v5i1.2826>
- Varghese, J. and Musthafa, M. M. A. (2021). Why the optimism misses? an analysis on the gaps and lags of teachers' perceptions of 21st century skills. *Shanlax International Journal of Education*, 10(1), 68-75. <https://doi.org/10.34293/education.v10i1.4322>
- West, A., et al. (2017). Ch. 11 scaffolding. Pressbooks.Pub; Pressbooks. <https://pressbooks.usnh.edu/teachingdiverselearners/chapter/scaffolding-2/>